

1
2
3
4
5
6 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
7 FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

8 First Service Networks Incorporated,)
9 Plaintiff,) No. CV-11-1897-PHX-DGC
10 v.)
11 First Service Maintenance Group)
12 Incorporated,)
13 Defendant.)
14 _____)
15 This case was referred to the undersigned on October 5, 2012 for purposes of
16 conducting a settlement conference. (Doc. 55)
17 On October 10, 2012, counsel for Plaintiff and Defendant placed a conference
18 call to the undersigned's judicial assistant to secure a possible date and time, preferably
19 prior to December 10, 2012, for a settlement conference. Counsel were given December
20 6, 2012 at 2:00 p.m. as an available date and time for a settlement conference and were
21 advised this date would be held through 3:00 p.m., October 12, 2012, for counsel to
22 consult with their clients and settlement authority representatives.
23 On October 12, 2012, the undersigned's judicial assistant emailed counsel to
24 advise the court had not heard from either counsel and would continue to reserve
25 December 6, 2012 at 2:00 p.m. through the end of October 15, 2012 and, if the court had
26 not heard from either counsel by that time, the settlement conference would be formally
27 set.
28 On October 15, 2012, the undersigned's judicial assistant received an email from

SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE ORDER

1 Kenneth Motolenich-Salas, counsel for Defendant, to advise a settlement conference
2 would be futile. In light of the fact that a settlement conference was never formally set,
3 the undersigned's judicial assistant sent an email to counsel, advising a Stipulation or
4 Motion addressed to the assigned U. S. District Judge David G. Campbell, must be filed
5 advising counsel are in agreement that a settlement conference should not be scheduled at
6 this time.

7 On October 25, 2012, the docket reflects that neither counsel had filed a
8 Stipulation or Motion advising the parties are not desirous of a settlement conference
9 being scheduled, the undersigned issued an Order, doc. 62, that the parties had until
10 November 2, 2012 within which to file the appropriate Stipulation or Motion with Judge
11 Campbell, the assigned United States district judge to this case, or the undersigned would
12 issue a formal order setting a settlement conference to a date and time convenient to the
13 Court's calendar, mandating the physical appearance of lead counsel, each party and
14 insurance representative, if any.

15 On November 1, 2012, Plaintiff filed a Notice of Availability for Settlement
16 Conference, doc. 63, advising that it remains available to participate in a settlement
17 conference as ordered.

18 Accordingly, a settlement conference will now formally be scheduled as set forth
19 below.

20 The purpose of the Settlement Conference is to facilitate settlement of this case,
21 if that is appropriate. It will be conducted in such a manner as not to prejudice any party
22 in the event a settlement is not reached. To that end, the offer and demand, if any,
23 communicated to the undersigned in confidence will be kept confidential and will not be
24 disclosed to any adverse party absent express consent to do so. Rule 408, Federal Rules of
25 Evidence, applies to all aspects of the Settlement Conference. All communications and
26 information exchanged in and during the settlement process, not otherwise discoverable,
27 will not be admissible in evidence for any purpose and shall not be used for any purpose
28 outside the Settlement Conference itself. At the conclusion of the Settlement Conference,

1 all documents submitted and exchanged by the parties shall be returned, destroyed, or
2 otherwise disposed of in the manner directed by the Settlement Judge upon the request of
3 any party.

4 At the Settlement Conference and subject to modification by the Court
5 depending on the uniqueness of each case, each party, through counsel or individually if
6 unrepresented, may be asked to give a brief presentation outlining the factual and legal
7 highlights of that party's case and/or respond to general and a specific questions by the
8 Settlement Judge. Thereafter, separate and private caucuses will be held with each party,
9 the party's representative and the Settlement Judge. Complete candor with the Court is
10 not only expected but is required. *In the Matter of Fee*, 182 Ariz. 597, 898 P.2d 975
11 (1995).

12 This Order mandating the physical appearance of the parties, corporate
13 representatives and insurers is intended to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of the
14 Settlement Conference by reducing the time for communication of offers and expanding
15 the ability to explore the varied options for settlement, give the adverse parties the
16 opportunity to hear the rationale and arguments regarding the likelihood of success of the
17 claims/defenses directly from the lawyers who will be trying the case, meet the litigants
18 themselves, and hear first-hand the candid comments, if any, made by the Settlement
19 Judge about the case or the judicial process.

20 Years of experience has taught the undersigned that the physical presence, rather
21 than the availability by telephone, of those individuals with the authority to settle cases
22 substantially increases the likelihood of settlement and leads to more meaningful
23 negotiations.

24 Consequently, pursuant to the authority granted to the Court in, among others, 28
25 U.S.C. §473(b)(5) and Rule 16(b), FED.R.CIV.P., the parties and representatives of the
26
27
28

1 parties with "full and complete authority"¹ to discuss settlement of the case **SHALL**
 2 physically appear at the date and time of the Settlement Conference unless expressly
 3 excused by the undersigned by timely motion and order issued prior to the subject
 4 settlement conference for good cause shown. *In re Novak*, 932 F.2d 1397, 1407 (11th Cir.
 5 1991) ("... we conclude that the power to direct parties with full settlement authority at
 6 pretrial settlement conferences is inherent in the district courts.").

7 **IT IS ORDERED:**

8 1. All parties and their counsel who are responsible for the case **SHALL**
 9 physically appear before the undersigned Settlement Judge, Courtroom 302, Sandra Day
 10 O'Connor U. S. Courthouse, 401 West Washington, Phoenix, Arizona on **Friday,**
 11 **January 11, 2013 at 2:00 p.m.** The Court has allocated 2 hours for the Settlement
 12 Conference or longer if meaningful progress is being made towards settlement.
 13

14 If the Defendant is an insured party, a representative of that party's insurer with
 15 full and complete authority to discuss and settle the case **SHALL** physically appear at the
 16 aforesaid date and time. An uninsured or self-insured corporate party **SHALL** physically
 17 appear at aforesaid Settlement Conference through its authorized representative with full
 18 and complete authority to discuss and settle the case. *Pitman v. Brinker International,*
 19 *Inc.*, 216 F.R.D. 481 (D. Ariz. 2003), amended on review in part in *Pitman v. Brinker*
 20 *International, Inc.*, 2003 WL 23353478, 1 (D. Ariz. 2003); *Gee Gee Nick v. Morgan's*
 21 *Foods, Inc.*, 270 F.3d 590 (8th Cir. 2001) (District judge acted well within his discretion
 22 by imposing a monetary fine payable to the Clerk of the District Court as a sanction for
 23

24 1 "Full and complete authority" within this Order means that the individual appearing
 25 for, or on behalf of, the Defendant(s) shall have the express authority and discretion to
 26 authorize the payment to, or accept the terms of, Plaintiff's last settlement demand. "Full and
 27 complete authority" does not mean, however, that Defendant or representative is required to
 28 pay such demand or any sum whatsoever. *Kothe v. Smith*, 771 F.2d 667, 669 (2nd Cir.1985)
 (Rule 16 "was not designed as a means for clubbing the parties-or one of them-into an
 involuntary compromise."); *In re Novak*, 932 F.2d at 1406 n. 18.

1 failing to prepare requested memorandum and deciding to send a corporate representative
2 to ADR conference with limited authority.); *Lockhart v. Patel*, M.D., 115 F.R.D. 44
3 (E.D.Ky 1987) (In medical malpractice action, answer stricken for failure of insurance
4 representative with authority to settle to appear at settlement conference.).

5 2. Experience teaches that settlement conferences are often unproductive unless
6 the parties have exchanged settlement demands and compromise offers before the
7 conference and have made a serious effort to settle the case on their own. Accordingly,
8 before arriving at the settlement conference, the parties shall negotiate and make good
9 faith efforts to settle the case without the involvement of the Court. The parties shall
10 exchange written correspondence regarding settlement. The Plaintiff's demand shall be
11 delivered to defense counsel and the insurer's representative, if any, not less than **20 days**
12 before the Settlement Conference. Defendant's response to the demand shall be delivered
13 to Plaintiffs' counsel not less than **12 days** before the Settlement Conference.

14 3. If a third person or entity asserts a substantial lien on any settlement monies
15 for medical and hospital expenses and/or lost wages paid, such as, a worker's
16 compensation carrier or a health insurance carrier, arrangements shall be made to notify
17 said person or entity of the Settlement Conference so that such person, entity or its
18 authorized representative may appear and participate in the Settlement Conference.
19 Plaintiff's counsel shall promptly provide a true and complete copy of this Order to such
20 person, entity or its authorized representative. A.R.S. §23-1023(c); *Stout v. State*
21 *Compensation Fund*, 197 Ariz. 238, 3 P.3d 1158 (2000).

22 4. In the absence of a prior order by the undersigned to the contrary, copies of all
23 Settlement Conference Memoranda shall be exchanged between counsel, at least, **five (5)**
24 **business days before the Settlement Conference.** Counsel shall provide a copy of all
25 memoranda to their client(s) for review prior to the Settlement Conference and shall
26 explain the settlement conference procedures to their clients before the Settlement
27 Conference.
28

1 Each party shall provide the Court with the original of that party's Settlement
2 Conference Memoranda, **at least, five (5) business days before the Settlement**
3 **Conference.** The Settlement Conference Memoranda shall **NOT** be filed with the Clerk.
4 The original Settlement Conference Memoranda shall be delivered directly to the
5 chambers of U. S. Magistrate Judge Lawrence O. Anderson or e-mailed to the
6 undersigned's ECF mailbox (anderson_chambers@azd.uscourts.gov).² If a party's
7 Settlement Conference Memoranda contains more than two exhibits and/or if an exhibit is
8 more than ten pages, the original Settlement Conference Memoranda's attachments shall
9 be separated by tabs to facilitate the Court's review and delivered directly to the chambers
10 of U. S. Magistrate Judge Lawrence O. Anderson and **not** e-mailed to the undersigned's
11 ECF mailbox. Each Memorandum shall address the following:
12 a. A brief statement of the facts of the case.
13 b. A brief statement of the claims and defenses, i.e., statutory or other grounds
14 upon which the claims are founded, including the citation to appropriate authorities; the
15 reasonable damages allegedly incurred by Plaintiff and, if appropriate, Counterclaimant; a
16 forthright evaluation of the parties' likelihood of prevailing on the claims and defenses;
17 and a description of the major issues in dispute.
18 c. A brief summary of the proceedings to date including rulings on motions and
19 motions outstanding, if any.
20 d. An estimate of the costs and time to be expended for further discovery,
21 pretrial and trial, including past and future attorneys' and experts' fees.
22 e. A brief statement of the facts and issues upon which the parties agree and
23 disagree.
24

27 ² This mailbox is not to be used as a general means of communication to the Court or
28 its staff.

1 f. Whether there is/are any distinct or dominant issue(s) which, if resolved,
2 would likely aid in the disposition of the case.

3 g. The relief sought.

4 h. Each party's position on settlement, including the amount that the Plaintiff is
5 currently willing to accept and Defendant(s) is/are willing to offer and the history of past
6 settlement discussions, offers and demands.

7 In the absence of any Order by the undersigned to the contrary, each party's
8 Settlement Conference Memoranda shall not exceed seventeen (17) pages exclusive of
9 attachments and shall otherwise comply with LRCiv 7.2, 7.2(a) and 7.1(b)(1), Rules of
10 Practice for the United States District Court for the District of Arizona, as amended on
11 December 1, 2011. No responsive or supplemental memorandum shall be permitted
12 unless expressly authorized by prior court order.

13 5. If the Settlement Conference is held, the Court will assume that the parties
14 have agreed to separate meetings (caucuses) with the Settlement Judge. Judicial and
15 lawyer ethical rules prohibit *ex parte* caucuses without such agreement. By appearing at
16 this conference, the Court will deem that the parties have consented to this procedure and
17 waived any objection thereto unless a written Objection is filed not less than three (3)
18 business days before the Settlement Conference.

19 6. Absent good cause shown, if any party, counsel or insurer's representative
20 fails to promptly appear at the Settlement Conference, fails to comply with the terms of
21 this Order, including the failure to timely provide the settlement conference memoranda,
22 is substantially unprepared to meaningfully participate in the Settlement Conference, or
23 fails to participate in good faith in the Settlement Conference, the settlement conference
24 may be vacated and sanctions may be imposed pursuant to Rules 16(f) and
25 37(b)(2)(A)(ii)-(vii), Federal Rules of Civil Procedure which may also include the entry
26 of default judgment, dismissal of the Complaint and/or an award of reasonable attorney's
27 fees.

1 fees and expenses and/or a finding of contempt. *G. Heileman Brening, Inc. v. Joseph Oat*
2 *Corporation*, 871 F.2d 648 (7th Cir. 1989); *Lockhart v. Patel*, M.D., *supra*; *Gee Gee Nick*
3 *v. Morgan's Foods, Inc.*, *supra*.

4 7. Counsel and any party, if unrepresented by counsel, shall notify the Court in
5 writing, at least, **ten (10) business days** before the Settlement Conference if one or more
6 of the attorneys or unrepresented parties believes that the Settlement Conference would
7 be a futile act resulting in a waste of time and money, inconsistent with Rule 1,
8 FED.R.CIV.P., because, for example, either side has adopted an unreasonable position
9 from which that party refuses to deviate. The Court will then consider whether the
10 Settlement Conference would be helpful and, if not, whether the Settlement Conference
11 should be canceled or other forms of the alternative dispute resolutions be considered. If
12 there is disagreement between or among the attorneys or unrepresented parties on this
13 issue or any other issue which warrants vacating the Settlement Conference, they are
14 instructed to arrange a telephonic conference with the Court and all counsel as soon as
15 reasonably practical. If no such conference is arranged, it will be presumed that all
16 counsel, their clients and any unrepresented party believe that there is a reasonable, good
17 faith opportunity for settlement, and that the involvement of a Settlement Judge is needed
18 to accomplish it.

19 8. **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that counsel shall keep the Court apprised of
20 the possibility of settlement and should settlement be reached, the parties shall
21 immediately file a Notice of Settlement with the Clerk of the Court with a copy to this
22 Court's chambers.

DATED this 16th day of November, 2012.

Lawrence O. Anderson
Lawrence O. Anderson
United States Magistrate Judge